

**Interactive Teaching of Key Scientific Method Components
Part III: Information Literacy in Research Methods**

Instructor Guide

and

Student Reproducibles

Leanne C. Powner
University of Michigan
LPowner@umich.edu

Department of Political Science
5700 Haven Hall
505 South State Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1045

Prepared to accompany presentation at the American Political Science Association's Teaching and Learning Conference, Washington, DC, 18-20 Feb 2006. Feedback is appreciated via email.

© Leanne Powner, 2006. All rights reserved. Instructors participating in the TLC have permission to duplicate worksheets on this CD for use in their classrooms, provided that this and all other copyright notices remain intact and are duplicated on all copies.

Table of Contents

General Remarks	1
What Kind of Source Do I Need?	2
Research Library Scavenger Hunt	4
Exploring Primary Sources	7
Facts and Evidence	9
Student Reproducibles:	starting on IG p. 10
What Kind of Source Do I Need?	
Research Library Scavenger Hunt	
Exploring Primary Sources	
Facts and Evidence	

General Remarks

Intended Use

As a set, these worksheets introduce or review major components of information literacy. They ask students to learn about, and learn to use, library and electronic resources in an informed manner. Most ask students to use information resources to answer questions, or to consider the nature and possible sources of information needed for different research tasks.

These worksheets are designed for use in a general research methods class on positive methods in political science. I assume that students are beyond introductory-level coursework and have at least a basic grounding in political science's substantive areas. Examples are drawn from American, comparative, and world politics. The worksheets are not constructed for use with any particular text or approach; they are independent of one another and may be used in any sequence or combination. They are not, however, a comprehensive course on information literacy. Instructors and librarians should consider the adequacy of this coverage and consider supplementary instruction based on their own needs and course objectives.

With the exception of the Research Library Scavenger Hunt, the documents are intended for use in *unedited* form. They are included in this document in PDF format. The Scavenger Hunt is also included in MS Word format as a separate file on the CD. Research libraries come in all shapes and sizes; items used in the Scavenger Hunt's original form may not be available at all schools. Instructors should feel free to modify the body of this document as needed with respect to their pedagogical needs and source availability. (Other document formats may be available upon request to LPowner@umich.edu.) Please leave the copyright notice intact on all other reproduced pages.

Format of Following Sections

Each of the following sections addresses one of the student worksheets included on this CD. For each, I:

- describe the assignment and its purposes,
- identify corresponding elements of the ACRL/LPSS Research Competency Guidelines supported by that worksheet,
- note the estimated time for student completion, based on student feedback,
- discuss how the worksheet might be integrated into most standard undergraduate positivist research design courses,
- comment on any relevant pedagogical or methodological assumptions, claims, or strategies appropriate for that worksheet, and
- provide an answer key, where appropriate.

Standards are identified as Standard.Performance Indicator: Outcome.

What Kind of Source Do I Need?

Description

This exercise asks students to select from a set of *types* of sources – news sources, academic outlets, primary sources, websites, and others – to identify which are likely to be useful in making a particular argument or writing a specific type of assignment. Students are encouraged to search these sources as needed to determine what particular types of useful information are in each.

Standards

- 1.1: Recognizes that a 30-page research paper, a policy memo, or an essay-type ‘response paper’ will require different types of information
- 1.2: Knows how information is formally and informally produced, organized, and disseminated.
- 1.2: Identifies the purpose and audience of potential resources.
- 1.2: Identifies the value and differences of potential resources in a variety of formats.
- 1.2: Differentiates between primary and secondary sources, recognizing how their use and importance can vary across disciplines. (partial)
- 1.2: Realizes that information may need to be constructed with raw data from primary sources.
- 1.3: Determines the availability of needed information and makes decisions on broadening the information seeking process beyond local resources. (partial)
- 2.1: Investigates the scope, content, and organization of information retrieval systems.
- 2.1: Determines if government reports or other government sources are necessary, and chooses appropriate sources to find them.
- 3.4: Determines whether information satisfies the research or other information need. (partial)

Duration

Students estimate this assignment takes about 45 minutes to complete if they include searches of the catalogues, databases, or internet as appropriate to help them determine what kinds of information are available in each source type. Less conscientious students needed about 20 minutes.

Integration

This assignment is appropriate for use earlier in a standard methods course, during discussions of kinds of data, kinds of writing political scientists do, and the role of evidence in making arguments in the social sciences.

Pedagogy

This worksheet assumes that students know what ‘primary sources’ are as this is one of the answer categories. Instructors may wish to discuss primary sources with the students, or perhaps assign the *Exploring Primary Sources* worksheet from this packet prior to or concurrently with this assignment.

The worksheet also specifies different types of research that students might do – for qualitative empirical work, for quantitative empirical work, for an evidence-supported opinion-editorial essay, etc. I assume that they are familiar with the distinction between qualitative and quantitative scholarship; this vocabulary is easily introduced. Students are probably subconsciously aware of the different kinds of evidence required for each of these different kinds of writing, but an explicit discussion here is a good way to clarify, for example, the role of counterexamples in qualitative research versus op-ed writing.

Question 5 references ‘empirical’ work without specifying whether this is qualitative or quantitative. Students may give answers consistent with both. This would provide an excellent place to start a discussion of the strengths and weaknesses of these types of work, or of the different information needs for each.

The nature of the prompts here and the tasks required of the students also provide a nice starting point for a discussion of search strategies, search terms, and search revisions. Users with the appropriate technological capabilities might use an in-class projection of the library catalogue or databases to demonstrate sophisticated search techniques like limiting, Boolean operators, and quotation marks.

Some students will inevitably produce source suggestions that are focused on obtaining ‘facts’ rather than obtaining information that serves as evidence for the proposed claims. This would provide a nice segue into issues of facts and evidence, as well as allowing the instructor the opportunity to make a preliminary assessment of the extent of support needed on this topic.

Answers

Answers will vary depending on library resources and student approaches.

Research Library Scavenger Hunt

Description

This worksheet asks students to explore the resources available in their college or university's library as they complete a series of tasks. It introduces major resources in the study of political science like government documents (the *Congressional Record* and *Foreign Relations of the United States*), news compilations (*Keesing's* and the *Africa Research Bulletin*), scholarly journals, and the library itself (catalogue, layout, and Library of Congress call number system).

Standards

- 1.2: Knows how information is formally and informally produced, organized, and disseminated.
- 1.3: Determines the availability of needed information and makes decisions on broadening the information seeking process beyond local resources. (partial)
- 2.1: Investigates the scope, content, and organization of information retrieval systems.
- 2.1: Selects efficient and effective approaches for accessing the information needed from the investigative method.
- 2.1: Selects efficient and effective approaches for accessing the information needed from subscription databases, free online search engines, indexes, etc.
- 2.1: Determines if government reports or other government sources are necessary, and chooses appropriate sources to find them. (partial; introduces ways to search and access particular types of government documents)
- 2.2: Understands that aggregate data sources may range from covering a multi-subject or multi-geographic area to a very specific subject or locality and chooses the most appropriate resource. (partial; introduces some particular and some general resources)
- 2.3: Uses various classification schemes and other systems to locate information within the library or to identify specific sites for physical exploration. (partial; first component only)
- 2.2: Uses specialized online or in-person services available at the institution to retrieve information needed.
- 2.4: Assesses the quantity, quality, and relevance of the search results to determine whether alternative information retrieval systems or investigative methods should be used.
- 2.5: Recognizes that sources must be cited and formatted according to a style manual and differentiates between the types of sources cited.
- 2.5: Records all relevant citation information for future reference.
- 5.3: Uses an appropriate political science citation method to consistently, accurately, and ethically cite sources.

Duration

Students who have some elementary familiarity with the library and citation find that this takes about 45 minutes to an hour. Absolute novices should expect an hour or more, though this time can be decreased by (sensible and intelligent) consultation with a reference librarian.

Integration

This is intended for use very early in a methods class as a means for familiarizing students with resources available to them in their research. It may also be appropriate for a more general 'introduction to political science' class, particularly if the instructor simplifies some of the questions or allows students to work in pairs.

Pedagogy

A very important element of preparation is to alert the reference staff to this assignment. Unwary reference librarians may be beguiled by wily (read, 'lazy') students into doing most of the work for them. Kudos to students who know enough about reference librarians to try this, but it would defeat the purpose of the assignment.

The nature of some of the questions on here almost guarantees that students who have less-than-expert knowledge of the library's resources, catalogue, and databases will need to consult a reference librarian at some point. (Some, like question 4, are virtually impossible to answer unless you already know of the appropriate source/resource for locating that information.) The day that this assignment is distributed would make an excellent time to invite a reference librarian to address the class on what these 'information specialists' can do for them. Even the best students are often unaware, since 'reference' to them often means encyclopedias, almanacs, and the like.

The worksheet explicitly asks students to use MLA and APA citation formats and directs them to an excellent resource on the library website of California State University at Los Angeles for concise citation guides. This provides an opportunity for instructors to discuss their preferred citation format; the CalState-LA site also has a nice Chicago handout if that is the instructor's preference. A discussion of footnotes and endnotes, both as citation devices and as places to put tangentially relevant or additional substantive remarks, is also appropriate here.

Answers

1. Answers will vary by student.

MLA bibliographic format would be: Last, First. *Book Title: Italics or Underline*. Publishing Location: Publisher, year.

APA bibliographic format would be: Last, First. (Year). *Book Title in Italics*. Publishing Location: Publisher. [NB: The period after year is *outside* the parenthesis.]

2. a) JX 232.A3 (for most libraries).

b) 7 volumes: National Security, UN/Western Hemisphere, Western Europe, Central/Eastern Europe and the USSR, Near East/South Asia/Africa, East Asia and the Pacific, Korea.

c) "Memorandum by the Counselor (Kennan) to the Secretary of State." [NB: Interesting document about whether the North Korean attack on South Korea was perceived to have been a direct coordinated plan of the Soviet Union.]

3. Hard copy access for:

MLA bibliographic format: Last, First. "Article Title." *Journal Title in Italics or Underline* VOL.ISS (year): startpage – endpage. [NB: The journal title is *not* followed by a period; volume and issue *are* separated by a period.]

APA bibliographic format: Last, First. (Year). Title of Article. *Title of Journal in Italics*, VOL(ISS), startpage - endpage. [NB: The journal title as well as volume and issue information are in italics.]

Electronic access for:

MLA bibliographic format: Last, First. "Article Title." *Journal Title in Italics or Underline*. Vol.Iss. Database name. Access Provider Name, Access Provider Location. Access Day Month Year <database portal URL in angle brackets>. [NB: Access Provider is usually your college or university's library, and that original source pagination is *not* included in the citation.]

APA bibliographic format: Last, First. (Year). Title of Article. *Title of Journal in Italics*, Vol(Iss), startpage – endpage. Retrieved Month Day, Year, from Database Name.

4. School nutrition programs. [NB: These answers can be located either through paper copies of the Congressional Record or, where available, through the microfiche collection. Some libraries may also have the published index of congressional hearings.]

5. Democratic Republic of the Congo

6. a) Israel's security fence.

b) Avineri, Shlomo. (2005). "Straddling the Fence." *Foreign Policy* 147: 72-73.

7. a) Roosevelt's speech to Congress two days after Pearl Harbor was bombed, on 9 December 1941. (The speech initially after, in which the United States declares war, is on 4923-4.)

b) The Communist party was re-legalized. (p. 39651) [NB: Series changes names, from *Keesing's Contemporary Archive* to *Keesing's Record of World Events*, and formats (weekly digests with internal country segments to country-focused entries by month). Pages continue to be numbered consecutively across the transition.]

8. Varies by instructor.

9. "Nazi Demands Met: Hitler Gets Almost All He Asked as Munich Conferees Agree." *New York Times* 30 Sept 1938: A1+. [NB: Like most newspapers of the time, the *Times* does not report an author for this article, since it is an editorial compilation of items from the rest of the major articles. In the lower part of the first column is an article by Frederick T. Birchall, "Powers Make Accord."]

10. United States. Department of State. , Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights and Labor. (2004).. "Supporting Human Rights an Democracy: The US Record, 2003-2004." Washington, DC: Government Publications Office.

Exploring Primary Sources

Description

The first page of this reproducible contains a discussion of different types of primary sources and some general information about locating and using them. It also addresses, albeit briefly, some of the major problems of reliability and bias that may occur in these sources. Instructors not wishing to assign the activity will find that the informational side works well as a supplementary handout. The activity on the reverse asks students to read an 'Electronic Briefing Book' of declassified government documents from the National Security Archive's website and to comment on any bias or 'angle shift' between the different commenting agencies.

Standards

- 1.2: Differentiates between primary and secondary sources, recognizing how their use and importance can vary across disciplines.
- 1.2: Realizes that information may need to be constructed with raw data from primary sources.
- 2.1: Determines if government reports or other government sources are necessary, and chooses appropriate sources to find them. (partial)
- 2.3: Uses surveys, letter, interviews, data and other forms of inquiry to retrieve primary information.
- 3.1: Reads the text and selects main ideas.
- 3.1: Restates textual concepts in own words and selects data accurately.
- 3.2: Examines and compares information from various sources in order to evaluate reliability, validity, accuracy, authority, timeliness, and point of view or bias.
- 3.2: Recognizes prejudice, deception, or manipulation. (partial)

Integration

An appropriate point to use this worksheet might be around the time of reading a qualitative article that relies primarily on primary sources for its data, or around the time when students begin collecting their own data from qualitative and primary sources.

Duration

Depending on the length of the documents in the selected briefing book, this worksheet takes students about 30 minutes to an hour (not including the challenge).

Pedagogy

Your library may have access to some of the Archive's full-scale research products. These consist of detailed timelines of major crises or US foreign policy issues and extensive collections of declassified documents. These collections are available in microfiche or via an online subscription service.

The Archive's researchers have found a variety of factual inaccuracies in Henry Kissinger's memoirs, and some press releases and briefing books are dedicated to presenting documentary

evidence of the errors. Most of these errors are blatantly in Kissinger's favor. Presenting one or two of these along with copies of relevant pages from the memoirs themselves may help to drive home the point that while memoirs are useful for some things, their factual accuracy can and should often be quite suspect.

Answers

Answers will vary by student.

Facts and Evidence

Description

Students are presented with a proposed thesis for a term paper and three pieces of information. Two of these pieces of information are evidence for the thesis, but one is simply a ‘fact’ – a piece of information that, while accurate and interesting, is not particularly valuable for supporting the argument at hand. Students are asked to select which piece of information is the ‘fact’ and explain why it does not belong in this essay.

Standards

- 1.4: Describes criteria used to make information decisions and choices.
- 3.4: Determines whether information satisfies the research or other information need.
- 3.4: Selects information that provides evidence for the topic.

Duration

Excluding the challenge, students should need 30 to 45 minutes to complete this worksheet.

Integration

This activity is appropriate towards the middle or end of a course involving the writing of an independent research paper, when students have identified a question, begun collecting data, and are beginning to outline and write. While such an activity is in theory of particular interest for an introduction to political science course, testing on freshmen suggests that they are generally unready for this without extensive support.

Pedagogy

Given the difficulty that students often seem to have with this topic – few, even among good students, have ever been *taught* this concept or even had it discussed with them – a full-class discussion of the answers is probably a valuable use of time. This is particularly true if the course’s assignments include a major research paper.

Answers

1. a. The amount of available Arctic oil does not tell anything about the consequences of Carter’s plan for particular groups in society.
2. a. The total number of restrictions, and even passage margins, tell nothing about implementation behavior or recent changes in implementation behavior. (High passage margins might give some information, though, about the perceived level of legitimacy; the drop in legitimacy is assumed here in the thesis.)
3. b. Combatant casualties might give information about the intensity of the American initiatives, but again, the extensiveness of the initiatives is not the argument of the paper. The infamous

'body counts' give no information that supports, refutes, or allows construction of support for an argument about Johnson's motivations.

4. This is less clear than most. C is probably the closest to being less-useful for this argument, mostly on the basis that votes against Chirac are not necessarily votes in favor of the opposition. A and B are clearly more useful than C.

What Kind of Source Do I Need?

Political scientists have a wide range of sources available for use in research. Which sources an author selects are based on his or her information needs to provide evidence or support for the author's intended argument.¹ Different types of sources contain different types of information. An encyclopedia will tell you the capital of Mali, but it will not tell you about the probable relationship between the government's drought policies, annual rainfall patterns, and irregular food shortages. This information would have to come from academic work on the subject, either in article or book form.

For each of the arguments listed below, identify two or more sources or source types from the list provided that would provide useful information for making that argument. Justify your answers in a sentence or two: What useful supporting information or evidence would likely come from this source?

- A. Lexis-Nexis Academic or ProQuest (newspaper and magazine database)
- B. JSTOR (scholarly journals and academic publications)
- C. Primary sources
- D. Websites
- E. Specialized news publications (Africa Research Bulletin, RFE/RL Report, etc.)
- F. Other

If you select C (primary sources), D (websites), E (specialized sources), and/or F (other), please specify what type: websites of policy organizations, congressional hearing transcripts, electronic versions of government publications, publicly available datasets from official sources, etc. You may find that doing brief web, database, or catalogue searches is helpful in determining what resources are available to you.

1. A comparative case study examining the role of outside (non-domestic) mobilization groups in the Ukrainian 'Orange Revolution' of November 2004 and the Georgian 'Rose Revolution' of November 2003.

2. A qualitative empirical argument that Congressional rejection of President Carter's energy policy was driven by members' concern over the short-term distributional implications of the proposals rather than by oil company donations and pressure, national security concerns, or environmental concerns.

¹ Many students use the reverse approach: They collect several easily accessible sources and then make an argument out of whatever information is in those sources. As your knowledge of research methods and research design should suggest, though, this is not a credible approach to making an argument, empirical or otherwise.

3. An essay arguing that the French revolution was triggered less by *group* perceptions of unequal taxation, and more by *individual* perceptions of the irrationality of tax incidence across individuals.

4. An op-ed style essay arguing that US policies intended to reduce global warming have had the perverse effect of increasing US emissions of greenhouse gasses, and that American policy should change rapidly to conform with new scientific evidence on this point.

5. An empirical paper investigating whether Russian support for the ongoing conflict in Chechnya responds to battle deaths and media coverage in the same manner that American public opinion responded to deaths and media coverage in the Vietnam War.

6. **Challenge:** A quantitative empirical study about the relationship between economic growth, human development, and government policies about the education of women in 163 developing countries.

Research Library Scavenger Hunt

Welcome to the wonderful world of a research library. Unlike most libraries with which you may be familiar, your college or university's library focuses on books and resources that are useful for conducting academic research. This includes basic things like encyclopedias and atlases, but it also includes items like scholarly journals, specialized reference books, and access to electronic news and information databases.

This exercise has two purposes. One is to expose you to some of the types of specialized sources of interest to political scientists that your library has available, and to help you learn to locate and use them. When you locate a source, you might want to spend a few minutes browsing it to familiarize yourself with it should you need it again in your own work. The second is to help you learn to cite different types of sources. Proper attribution of information is a hallmark of good science. Citation serves as both an acknowledgement of others' contribution and also as evidence or support for your claims. A good resource on citation styles is <http://www.calstatela.edu/library/styleman.htm>; your library or professor may also have additional resources. You will probably want to consult the reference librarians (who might be better called 'information specialists') for help in locating some of these sources.

1. Find a book by an author who shares your first or last name.

a) Write the full MLA style bibliographic citation for the book. _____

b) Write the full APA style bibliographic citation for the book. _____

c) What is the call number of this book? _____

d) Where in the library (what floor or region of the building) would you find this? _____

2. Use the *Foreign Relations of the United States* series for the next set of questions.

a) Where in the library is this set found? What is its call number? _____

b) How many volumes are in the 1950 series? List their topics (briefly). _____

c) What is the title of the document found on page 361 of Volume 1? _____

3. Find an article in a scholarly journal by a (different) author who shares your first or last name. (*Hint*: electronic access and hard-copy access citation formats differ!)

a) Write the full MLA style bibliographic citation for this article. _____

b) Write the full APA style bibliographic citation for this article. _____

4. The Senate Committee on Agriculture, Nutrition, and Forestry held a hearing on March 15, 2005. (*Hint*: There are several different ways to access this information.)

a) What was the topic of the hearing? _____

b) Pretend that you wanted to cite the first speaker's comments at this hearing. Write the MLA bibliographic citation. _____

5. Locate the *Africa Research Bulletin*. What country is covered on page 1 of the Political, Social and Cultural series issue for June 2004? _____

6. a) What is featured in the photograph on page 73 of the March/April 2005 issue of *Foreign Policy*? _____

b) Provide the full APA bibliographic citation for the article in which that photo is found.

c) In what part of the library is this journal issue found? _____

7. a) What major world event is covered on page 4925 of *Keesing's Contemporary Archive*?

b) What happened to the Communist Party of Moldova in September 1993?

8. Use the Social Sciences Citation Index to investigate your professor.

a) How many times has your professor been cited by others? _____

b) How many items has your professor written that appear in the index? _____

9. Provide the MLA format citation for the headline story of the *New York Times* on September 30, 1938. _____

10. The US Department of State releases an annual document about human rights and democracy in countries around the world. Provide the APA format citation for the 2003-4 version of this document. _____

Exploring Primary Sources

Primary sources contain material – information and ideas – that have not been filtered through another person’s mind or work. Some examples of primary sources include:

- *memoirs* – books written by important people giving their perspective on things they did or their role in events. Winston Churchill, Harry Truman, Charles de Gaulle, Bill Clinton, Hillary Rodham-Clinton, and many other prominent politicians and public figures have written these. These are useful if what you want is information about actors’ *perceptions* about what is occurring, rather than facts on the occurrences or events themselves.
- *government documents* – internal documents like memoranda or meeting notes, or publicly released documents like reports. Most US federal agencies place all their press releases on their web sites. Documents related to foreign affairs are often published by governments after a period of time; American documents can be found in the *Foreign Relations of the United States* series. US government agencies are required to deposit copies of certain types of publications at Federal Depository Libraries; ask a reference librarian if your school’s library is a federal depository.
- *archival documents* – unpublished period documents. Diaries, letters, and personal papers are sometimes available in archives, though only rarely in published form. Archives might also include unpublished documents. Presidential libraries contain large collections of unpublished documents, like presidential diaries, personal correspondence, and papers belonging to senior aides and staff. Archives can contain older government documents and other materials like film footage, still photographs, or objects.
- *transcripts* – verbatim copies of speeches or interviews. Full transcripts of House and Senate debates and committee hearings are available in the *Congressional Record*. US federal agencies often include transcripts of interviews or speeches given by their senior officials on their web sites. Some think-tanks also publish proceedings transcripts of conferences that they have hosted on their websites.
- *newspaper articles* – articles reporting news and factual information. These can serve as primary sources *if* the material you gather from them is facts, like dates and times, or quotations.

Primary sources contrast with secondary sources, which contain information that has been filtered through another person’s analysis first. Scholarly books, popular books, most kinds of magazine articles, many newspaper articles, and most other things are secondary sources.

Users of primary sources must be alert to the fact that these sources are not always accurate. Henry Kissinger’s memoirs, for example, are notoriously full of errors – most of which make him look more accurate or otherwise better than he actually may have appeared at the time. Bureaucrats may have an incentive to dissemble; newspaper writers may only have part of the story or have biased informants; politicians have incentives to say things other than their own personal preferences when they speak in public.

The National Security Archive, housed at George Washington University, is a non-profit organization that collects and publishes declassified government documents obtained under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA). FOIA allows interested organizations and individuals to petition the government to declassify and release documents related to any topic the requester demands. While the process is slow and cumbersome, it has resulted in the declassification of a number of important documents. The National Security Archive focuses on major crises and debates about security policy, and it has amassed a substantial collection of declassified documents. It publishes many of these in edited, indexed collections, which your library may

have in electronic or microfiche form, but it also publishes short 'Electronic Briefing Books' on its website about current topics. These collections include declassified government documents obtained from various agencies.

Go to the Archive's website, <http://www.nsarchive.org>, and select an electronic briefing book that contains documents authored by different agencies or organizations. Read the documents contained in it. In what ways do the agencies' perspectives on the topic or issue differ? You might consider the kinds of information that interest each agency, the policy option(s) each advocates, or anything else that appears pertinent. If you were using these documents as primary sources for a paper, what kinds of bias might you suspect in these documents?

Briefing Book Title: _____

Authoring Agencies/Offices: _____

Challenge: Find a piece of potentially biased or suspect information in one of your documents. How could you verify this information? Try to name a specific source, from a catalog search or something else, that would provide corroborating information.

Facts and Evidence

There's a lot of information out there. This is both a good thing and a bad thing. Sometimes doing research for a paper produces a lot of useful information that the author needs to know as background, but which is not necessarily something that the reader needs to know to evaluate the argument. Learning to weed through information and separate *evidence* – information that provides support for or against an argument – from *facts* – pieces of information that are valid but less relevant or necessary – is a difficult but important skill.

The questions below present a thesis for a term paper and then three pieces of information. Two of these are evidence that supports (or refutes) the proposed thesis; the third is factually correct but not really relevant or necessary for the argument. Identify which of the pieces of information is not evidence for the claim, and briefly justify (1-2 sentences) why this fact is not useful in this term paper.

1. *Thesis:* Congressional rejection of President Carter's energy policy was driven by members' concern over the short-term distributional (i.e., district-level) implications of the proposals rather than by national security concerns or environmental concerns.

- a) projected oil production from Arctic drilling and an analysis of the probable environmental implications
- b) testimony from the Congressional Budget Office on the domestic implications of Carter's plan (see <http://www.cbo.gov/showdoc.cfm?index=5297&sequence=0>)
- c) a private think tank's analysis of the cost to consumers of phased energy deregulation and the likely effects of higher energy costs on the economy

2. *Thesis:* The UN's moral authority over states has decreased substantially since the 2005 revelation of the Oil-For-Food scandals.

- a) the total number of UN resolutions passed since 1948 and the number of votes for and against each
- b) recent newspaper accounts of two states publicly expressing their intentions to suspend compliance with UN restrictions on other sanctioned countries
- c) a sharp decline in submission rates for certain annual reports that the UN requires of member-states

3. *Thesis:* US President Lyndon Johnson used intensive military initiatives in Vietnam to boost his flagging domestic popularity; the effectiveness of this tactic decreased over time.

- a) weekly data on popular support for Johnson's policies during his presidency from a major polling agency
- b) primary source documents from the Johnson Administration about enemy combatant casualties
- c) dates of major US military offensives during the Vietnam War collected from histories of the war

4. *Thesis:* The French rejection of the EU Constitution in May 2005 was less a vote against Europe than a vote against the incumbent Chirac government, thus demonstrating that voters construe even important European referenda as 'second-order' votes on domestic issues.

- a) opinion poll data showing overwhelming popular support for further European integration in general
- b) opinion poll data showing weak popular support for the Chirac government
- c) op-ed pieces by leading members of the opposition encouraging votes for the Constitution

5. **Challenge.** *Thesis:* Voting among 18-30 year olds in the 2005 German elections hinged mostly on economic issues, while 30-55 year olds were motivated to vote by postmodern issues like the environment and gender equality. *Identify two pieces of evidence that would support this argument and one fact that would not be relevant, then explain why the fact is not useful. (Hint: Think about what kinds of information would be useful here.) Use another sheet if necessary.*